

# Symbolic Battle in Benoa Bay Reclamation Bali Indonesia

Arya Pageh Wibawa

Indonesian Institute of The Arts (ISI) Denpasar, Jalan Nusa Indah, Denpasar, Bali, Indonesia

**Abstract:** Bali as a well-known tourist destination in the world, began to bother with the reclamation plan that announced by the government based on PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 on urban areas spatial planning of Denpasar, Badung, Gianyar, and Tabanan, where the government would make Benoa Bay revitalization related to its space utilization. The reclamation plans raises the pros and cons. This research aimed to describe the forms, strategies, and the factors that led to symbolic battles that occur in Bali society because of Benoa bay reclamation. The method used in this research is qualitative descriptive. This research aims to provide an overview of the symbolic battle that occurred on Bali Benoa bay reclamation based on the observation in printed media or online media. Conclusions of this research shows that the symbolic battle that occurs due to Benoa bay reclamation plan carried out by the dominant group (orthodoxa) by using the recognition form of one meaning, logic, perspective, and certain value that is PERPRES No. 51 of 2014. While opponents (heterodoxa) denial by providing unnoticed rules by the dominant group (orthodoxa) and conduct mass actions to oppose the dominant group. The strategy taken by dominant group (orthodoxa) in symbolic battle are euphemization and sensorization by giving reclamation advantages as reason such as additional tourism accommodation and employment. Whereas previously orthodoxa group issued circular letter requesting the temporary suspension of tourism accommodation construction for the Southern of Bali area i.e. Gianyar regency, Badung and Denpasar city because "overcapacity". Therefore, the commitment of orthodoxa group in Benoa bay reclamation needs to be asked again. The factors that cause symbolic battle are differences in interests between orthodoxa group and heterodoxa group. The dominant group (orthodoxa) considering it important to reclamation because there are social and economic value that can improve the lives of the Balinese people. Meanwhile, according to opponents (heterodoxa) that reclamation can interfere social and cultural life, namely the Tri Hita Karana that could be catastrophic for the Balinese people as result of disrupted existing balance and harmony.

**Keywords:** Reclamation, Symbolic Battle

## 1. Introduction

Bali as a well-known tourist destination in the world, began to bother with the reclamation plan that announced by the government based on PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 on urban areas spatial planning of Denpasar, Badung, Gianyar, and Tabanan, where the government would make Benoa Bay revitalization related to its space utilization

Benoa Bay is part of the Bali regional waters that play pivotal role in maintaining the ecosystem and hydrology stability in Benoa Bay and surrounding, and serves to provide protection services, economics to local socio-cultural. Benoa Bay has intertidal shaped bay surrounded by mangrove forests as protection from large waves from Jimbaran Peninsula in the West, Benoa Peninsula and Serangan Island in the east. The shape of the bay is relatively flat and very shallow, so most of the seabed exposed at low tide. Sediment in the northern part of the bay consists of black clay and sand with precipitate, reflects the input of terrestrial alluvium from the rivers flowing into the bay. Sediment in the bay have many forms from rough sand as gravel to sand with precipitate in its coastal (Sudiarta et.al,2013) .

The reclamation plan emergence based on PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 raises the pros and cons. According to the pro reclamation, the reclamation made will not lead to environmental damage even reclamation tend to improve on better nature. Instead, according to the people who oppose reclamation, reclamation will cause new problems such as the floods, population, and environmental damage.

## 2. Objective

This study aimed to describe the forms, strategies, and the factors that cause symbolic battle that occurred in Balinese society because of Benoa bay reclamation based on PERPRES No. 51 of 2014.

The data source text on Benoa bay reclamation Bali obtained from the mass media both printed and electronic. This study uses the Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) by Norman Fairclough. Data analyzed in three steps, i.e. text analysis (description), process analysis (interpretation), and analysis of socio-cultural practices (explanation). This discourse is interesting to be discussed, considering the symbolic battle is still going up as of this writing.

## 3. Method

The method used in this research is qualitative descriptive. This study aims to provide an overview of the symbolic battle that occurred on Bali Benoa bay reclamation based on the observation in printed and online media.

### *Data collection*

Data collected from print and electronic media including posters displayed by the society.

### *Data analysis*

The analysis used in this study is Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) by Norman Fairclough. Data analyzed in three steps, text analysis, discursive practices, and socio-cultural practices. According to Fairclough (Haryatmoko, 2016:22), Text is all that refers to speech, writings, graphics, and their

combinations or any other text linguistics form (repertoire of words, grammar, syntax, structure metaphors, rhetoric). Discursive practices are all production forms and texts consumption focusing on how the text author took discourse and existing genre with regard to how power relations played. Socio-cultural practices usually embedded in the purpose, network, and extensive social cultural practices where understanding intertextual have started to get, social events where it appears that the text formed by and forming social praxis.

## 4. Literature Review

### 4.1 Reclamation

According to the Merriam-Webster Dictionary, reclamation derived from French *reclamation* and Latin *reclamation-*, *reclamatio*, from *reclamare* which mean *the act or process of recovering; the state of being recovered*. Reclamation definition according to several reference sources are as follows:

- 1) Regulation of the Minister of Transportation No. PM 52 of 2011 mention that, reclamation is the pile work in waters or coastal that changing the shorelines and or waters depth contours.
- 2) Based on Beach Reclamation Development Guidelines and Security Building Planning (Yuwono & Kodoatie, 2004), beach reclamation is increasing land resources from less useful to more useful viewed from the environment, the needs of society and the economic value.
- 3) According to the Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 27 of 2007 on the Management of Coastal Areas and Small Islands, reclamation are activities carried out by people in order to increase the benefits of land resources viewed from the environmental and socio-economic by landfilling, land drying or drainage.
- 4) Based on Spatial Planning Guidelines for Coastal Reclamation Region, reclamation is a work / business to take advantage of land or area that relatively useless or still empty and watery to become useful by land drained. For example in coastal areas, swampy areas, offshore / in the sea, in the middle of a wide river, or lake (General, 2008).

### 4.2 Symbolic battle

Symbolic battle is a competition for power over other social actors, on existence, vision, perception, and appreciation. The cause are the difference in worldview, different points of view, and the difference in values. The goal is to get the power to produce and show the most recognized, most assumed to be true, most legitimated worldview (Jazeri, 2013).

The symbolic battle term first articulated by Pierre Bourdieu in his book *Language and Symbolic Power* (1991). According to Bourdieu, the words get power from speakers / executor. As expressed also by Austin that idiom has (Bourdieu, 2009:218):

- 1) "A meaning" in a language.
- 2) A "*illocutionary force* ", what is done by a speaker when speaking.

3) A "*perlocutionary force*" or the speak impact. Communicant will respond to the communicator because of information given.

According to Bourdieu (2009: xxii), language, meaning and symbolic systems of power holder implanted in the individuals mind through hidden mechanism from consciousness. That is what causes domination (doxa) discourse and marginalized discourse.

Doxa is a kind of social order within the individual who stable and tied into tradition as well as has fully naturalized power and unquestionable (2009: xxi). In real, doxa appeared through just received knowledge according to the habitus and the individual realm without thought or consideration in advance. In the struggle for the dominance (doxa), then appear the dominant group (orthodoxa) and opponent group (heterodoxa). It could be said that, orthodoxa as doxa owner group and heterodoxa group as doxa plaintiff group in which this group continues to fight against the establishment. Orthodoxa group considered as a group with capital and have the same habitus with most individuals, will be more able to maintain or change the structure compared with heterodoxa.

## 5. Data Analysis and Discussion

### 5.1 Data Analysis

#### 5.1.1 Text Analysis

PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 born with the aim to change the Benoa Bay area which is the water conservation areas (Zone L2) into a general use area that potential for maritime, fisheries, port, transport, tourism, economic development, housing, social, cultural, and religious. This stated in Article 56 and 63A of paragraphs 1 and 2 where Article 56 as an amendment of Article 56 PERPRES No. 45 of 2011 stated cultivation area change grouped into cultivation zone 1 (Zone B1), cultivation zone 2 (Zone B2), cultivation zone 3 (Zone B3), cultivation zone 4 (Zone B4), cultivation zone 5 (Zone B5), cultivation zone 6 (Zone B6), cultivation zone 7 (Zone B7), and buffer zone (Zone P). Article 63A paragraph stated that Zone P as referred to in Article 56 is the zone of coastal waters with bay area characteristics that faces the Zone L3, Zone B1, Zone B2, and Zone B3 in Benoa Bay Area, that maintain function of Zone L3, Zone B1, Zone B2, and Zone B3 as general use area potential for maritime, fisheries, port, transport, tourism, economic development, housing, social, cultural, and religious and paragraph (1) mentions Zone P as referred to in paragraph (1) set in the coastal waters of the Benoa Bay which in part of South Denpasar District, Denpasar City and part of South Kuta District, Badung Regency.

According to former cabinet secretary Dipo Alam, the changes of PERPRES No. 45 of 2011 into PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 started from Badung Regent's letter No. 523/3193 / Diskanlut, on 26 December 2012 to the Minister of Marine and Fisheries, regarding TOR Reclamation of Benoa Peninsula Beach and Pudut Island Badung Regency, Bali. Furthermore, the Governor of Bali by letter dated 23 December 2013 to the Coordinating Minister for Economic Affairs as Chairman of National Spatial Planning

Coordinating Board convey factual general conditions of space utilization in the Benoa Bay area, and simultaneously filed petition for L3 functions, particularly in Benoa Bay outside the Ngurah Rai Forest Park conservation area to be revisited, and proposed as a general use area, so that the area can be revitalized. "Governor of Bali request reviewed and acted upon Ministerial meeting coordinated by Coordinating Minister for Economic Affairs. In Rakortas dated 13 January 2014, Ministers under the coordination of Coordinating Minister for Economic Affairs approved changes to the PERPRES No. 45 of 2011 (PERPRES Sarbagita) while maintaining good governance, and conducted in accordance with the legislation", said Cabinet Secretary Dipo Alam, in Jakarta (Fajar, 2014). Cabinet Secretary add, one of good governance form, Director General of Marine, Coastal and Small Islands, Ministry of Marine and Fisheries, conveying the independent team's assessment, which stated that the waters of the Benoa Bay outside Ngurah Rai Forest Park no longer meets the criteria of marine conservation area.

### 5.1.2 Discursive Practices Analysis

The Bali local government intends reclaim Benoa Bay because they consider the Benoa Bay already changed and do not entirely meet the criteria of marine conservation area. Bali Provincial Government consider physical changes have occurred in the area such as the existence of toll roads, gas pipelines, and Benoa international port. Moreover, silting occurs in the Benoa Bay waters as result of the various activities in the area so spatial allocation adjustment is required (Fajar, 2014).

By looking at the condition then on 23 December 2013, the Governor sent a letter to the Coordinating Minister for Economic Affairs as Chairman of National Spatial Planning Coordinating Board, convey factual general conditions of space utilization in the Benoa Bay area, and simultaneously filed petition for L3 functions, particularly in Benoa Bay outside the Ngurah Rai Forest Park conservation area to be revisited, and proposed as a general use area, so that the area can be revitalized. Furthermore, on 26 December 2013, Badung Regent sent letter No. 523/3193 / Diskanlut, on 26 December 2012 to the Minister of Marine and Fisheries, regarding TOR Reclamation of Benoa Peninsula Beach and Pudut Island, Badung Regency, Bali. Finally, the central government responded by conducting a limited leadership meeting and decided to conduct review of Benoa Bay by forming an independent team of experts from several universities such as UGM, ITB, IPB, ITS, and Hasanuddin University. The conclusion of the study recommend the need for revitalization in the Benoa Bay if not then over time there will be massive silting that impact on the destruction of Mangrove Forest Park due to lack of water. According to study of an independent team, Benoa Bay which covering some 1800 hectares needs to be revitalized as a whole.

According to Dipo Alam former Cabinet Secretary, PERPRES Number 45 of 2011 changes has been approved by the Ministers under the coordination of Coordinating Minister for Economic Affairs while maintaining good governance, and conducted in accordance with the legislation (Fajar, 2014).

### 5.1.3 Socio-Cultural Practices Analysis

Balinese society that largely adheres to Hinduism, their

social and cultural life based on Hinduism. One of the Hinduism teachings related to nature and the environment is *Tri Hita Karana*. *Tri Hita Karana* derived from Sanskrit, *Tri* means three, *Hita* means prosperity, and *Karana* means causes so *Tri Hita Karana* is three main things that led to the welfare and prosperity of human life. *Tri Hita Karana* term first appeared on 11 November 1966 at the Regional Conference I Balinese Hindus Struggle Body located in, Perguruan Dwijendra Denpasar. Three main things that led to the welfare and prosperity of life rooted in the harmonious relationship between: (1) Man with God; (2) Humans with the natural environment; (3) Man with one another (Kusuma, 2012). The relationship balance of the three main points must applied continuously on Balinese society in everyday life to create comfort, tranquility, and peace.

### 5.2 Discussion

Based on the Law of Republic of Indonesia No. 12 of 2011 on the legislation establishment, the sort order for legislation from highest to lowest are as follows: (1) Act of 1945; (2) MPR decree; (3) Law / Government Regulation in lieu of Law; (4) Government regulations; (5) Presidential decree (PERPRES); (6) Provincial Regulation; (7) Local regulation (Regency / City). Existing laws in Indonesia is a very effective tool to see a domination perpetrated by the orthodox in showing its power. Social theory propounded by Karl Marx stated that coercion in the form of law, seen as a major factor for maintaining social institutions, such as private property, bondage (slavery), capital that cause inequality to the right and opportunity. Social inequality in society occurred because the operation coercion institutions that rely on violent ways, fraud, and oppression. Therefore, the fulcrum of social conflict is social inequality. Another view says that the state and the law seen as oppression tool used by the ruling class (capitalist) to their advantage (Setiadi, E. M., & Kolip, U., 2011:265). PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 is one form of coercion exercised by the dominant group (orthodox) to the marginalized group (heterodox). PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 has many deficiencies and need of deeper study considering other several higher or lower regulations, which not referenced. According Oktavia et.al (2015), Law No. 27 of 2007, article 34 stated that reclamation can only be implemented if the social and economic benefits greater than social cost and economic costs. In the law clearly said the need for intensive and deep environmental impact assessment the reclamation in order to obtain greater social and economic benefits.

Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 26 of 2007 Article 2 stated that In the framework of the Unitary Republic of Indonesia, spatial planning shall be based on the principle: a. cohesion; b. harmony and balance; c. sustainability; d. usability; e. openness; f. togetherness and partnership; g. public interest protection; h. legal and justice certainty; and i. accountability. Article 23 paragraph (6) stated that province spatial planning set with provincial regulations. In that article stated that all forms of province spatial planning determined by local regulations existed in the province. Based on Local Regulation of Bali province No. 16 of 2009 on Bali province Spatial Planning year 2009-2029 Article 11 paragraph (1) stated that development policy of protected



area include: a) maintenance and preservation of the environment; b) the prevention of human activities negative impacts that can cause environmental damage; c) recovery and environmental damage mitigation; d) mitigation and disaster-prone areas adaptation. In this article clearly stated that Bali has protected areas that must constantly maintained and preserved. One of the protected area is Benoa Bay. In section 3 stated strategy for prevention of human activities negative impacts that can cause environmental damage as referred to in paragraph 1 letter b) in section d) that mention to prevent actions that may directly or indirectly cause physical changes in the environment then the environment lost its function in supporting development. In this section clearly seen that the Province of Bali has regulations to prevent action that cause physical changes to the environment which has no function to support sustainable development. Reclamation will be an impact on the physical changes in the environment. Mishandling may cause problems in sustainable development (Oktavia et.al, 2015).

Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 26 of 2007 Article 65 paragraph (1) stated that spatial planning carried out by the government involving public participation and paragraph (2) stated that public participation in the spatial arrangement as described in paragraph (1) conducted through: (a) Participation in the spatial plan preparation; (b) Participation in space utilization; (c) Participation in the space utilization control.

Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 32 of 2009 on the Environmental Protection and Management Article 2 stated that protection and management of the environment carried out under the principles: a. state responsibility; b. preservation and sustainability; c. harmony and balance; d. cohesion; e. benefits; f. prudence; g. justice; h. ecoregions; i. biodiversity; j. polluter pays; k. participative; l. local wisdom; m. good governance; and n. regional autonomy.

According Karmila (2015), based on the Minister of Public Works Regulation No. 40/PRT/M/2007 on Spatial Planning Guidelines for Coastal Reclamation Region stated that reclamation NOT RECOMMENDED but can be done with respect to some provisions *beyond the mangrove forest which part of the protected areas or national parks, nature reserves and wildlife reserves*. Benoa Bay is an area with mangrove forests where reclamation carried out in the mangrove forest area, and this will obviously damage the ecosystem around mangrove. Decree of the President of the Republic of Indonesia No. 32 of 1990 article 37 paragraph (2) said that in nature reserves and cultural heritage, any aquaculture activities is prohibited, except for activities related to its functions and *not changing the landscape, use conditions of existing land and natural ecosystem*. PERPRES Republic of Indonesia No. 122 of 2012 on Reclamation in Coastal Areas and Small Islands Article 26, explained that reclamation implementation is required to maintain and take notice on *the balance between utilization interests and the coastal and small islands environment conservation interests*.

Additionally, PERPRES Republic of Indonesia No. 122 of 2012 on Reclamation in Coastal Areas and Small Islands Article 26 not considered in the decision including some

other regulations and legislation. So it can be said that PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 as a form of symbolic violence committed by Government as the dominant group to the marginalized groups which led to the conflict with the society. The rejection of the PERPRES No. 51 of 2014 made by cultural parade and installation Billboards along the Benoa Bay. Rejection action pictures of Benoa Bay reclamation can be seen below.



Picture 1: Form of Benoa Bay reclamation rejection

All of the above description are forms of symbolic battle in the form of a rejection of one meaning, logic, perspectives, and value proposed by the government on the issuance PERPRES No. 51 of 2014.

Symbolic violence goes two ways euphemization and sensorization (Bourdieu in Rusdiati, 2003:38-39). Euphemization used to make symbolic violence not visible, works in fine, unrecognizable, and selected by "unconscious". It usually in the form of trust, obligation, loyalty, courtesy, gift, loan, reward, or compassion. The sensorization mechanism make symbolic violence appears as form of the preservation of all values considered as "moral honor" such as courtesy, chastity, generosity, etc. which used to contrasted with "low morale " such as violence, criminal, inappropriate, immoral, greed, etc. Both forms are strategy undertaken by the dominant group (orthodoxa) to dominate and control the opponent group (heterodoxa). Euphemization and sensorization conducted

by the Governor of Bali by give a reason for Benoa Bay reclamation. According to the Governor of Bali, reclamation is for the future of Bali. The advantage of reclamation in Benoa Bay, in the region will built tourist accommodation and public facilities that will provide employment opportunities around 200,000 new jobs for the people of Bali within 5 to 10 years (Public Relations and Protocol Bureau of Bali Provincial Secretariat, 2013). Whereas previously Bali Provincial Government issued Governor of Bali circular letter No. 570/1665/BPM dated 27 December 2010 on temporary suspension of tourism accommodation development and investment for accommodation services. This policy is valid from 5 January 2011. The circular letter addressed to Badung Regency, Gianyar Regency, and Denpasar City because these three areas considered to have burnout tourism accommodation development and uncontrolled accommodation infrastructure development growth (Mastuty, I. T., Noak, P. A., & Supriyanti, N. W., 2015). This burnout caused by uncontrolled and rapid tourism accommodation growth in Southern of Bali area (Badung, Gianyar, Denpasar) thus experiencing "overcapacity".

Some sociologists describe back the more extensive and detailed root causes of conflict. They found some things that further reinforce the roots of conflict i.e. (Setiadi, E. M., & Kolip, U., 2011:361-363): (1) Differences between individual; (2) Conflict of interest either economically or politically; (3) Social change; (4) cultural difference. Meanwhile, theorists conflict adherents of conflict theories describes the main cause of conflict is their *difference or inequality relations in society that led to the interest differentiation*.

Benoa Bay as one of the areas in southern of Bali by overall total area measured at the outer side of the shoreline is 1.988,1 Hectares divided into three zones, zone 1 (zone with the bay mouth line drawn from Benoa harbor and Benoa Peninsula) covering an area of 1.668,3 hectares, zone 2 (zone between the harbor and the Serangan island) covering an area of 231,3 hectares, and zone 3 (zone between Suwung Kangin and Serangan island) covering an area of 88,5 hectares. Benoa Bay Area is an area with largest mangrove forest deployment in Bali with forest area 1.394,5 hectares or 62,9% of 2.215,5 hectares mangrove forest overall area in Bali. Based on the Ministry of Forestry of Indonesia No. 544/Kpts-II/93 dated 25 September 1993 established that 1.373,5 hectares of mangrove forests area designated as Forest Park called by Ngurah Rai Forest Park. Conflicts of interest on the Benoa Bay caused by strategic position held by the Benoa Bay. So it can be said that factors that cause conflict at Benoa Bay reclamation is differences in interests between the dominant group (orthodoxa) with the opponent group (heterodoxa). The dominant group considers it important to carry out reclamation because it have social and economic value that can improve the lives of balinese society. Meanwhile, according to opponents (heterodoxa) that reclamation can interfere with social and cultural life namely *Tri Hita Karana* that could be catastrophic for balinese society as a result of disrupted existing balance and harmony.

## 6. Conclusion

Symbolic battle occurs due Benoa Bay reclamation plan carried out by the dominant group (orthodoxa) using the form introduce one meaning, logic, perspective, and certain value PERPRES No. 51 of 2014. While opponent group (heterodoxa) denial by providing rules that unnoticed by the dominant group (orthodoxa) and carry out mass actions in efforts to oppose the dominant group. The strategy taken by dominant group (orthodoxa) in symbolic battle are euphemization and sensorization by giving the reason that reclamation provides the benefits such as additional tourism accommodation and employment. Whereas previously orthodoxa group has issued a circular requesting temporary suspension of tourism accommodation development for the Southern of Bali area i.e. Gianyar Regency, Badung Regency, and Denpasar City because "overcapacity". Therefore, the commitment of orthodoxa group in Benoa bay reclamation needs to be asked again. The factors that cause symbolic battle are differences in interests between orthodoxa group and heterodoxa group. Dominant group (orthodoxa) considering it important to reclamation because there are social and economic value that can improve the lives of the Balinese people. Meanwhile, according to opponents (heterodoxa) that reclamation can interfere social and cultural life, namely the *Tri Hita Karana* that could be catastrophic for the Balinese people as result of disrupted existing balance and harmony.

## References

- [1] Angelina, M., & Evelina, L. W. (2014). *Bingkai Pemberitaan Reklamasi Teluk Benoa, Bali* 1-10 Agustus 2013. *HUMANIORA*, 5(2), 803-815.
- [2] Bourdieu, P. (1979). *Symbolic power*. Critique of anthropology, 4(13-14), 77-85.
- [3] Biro Humas dan Protokol Sekretariat Daerah Provinsi Bali. (2013, August 5). *Benoa bay reclamation untuk masa depan Bali*. Retrieve from: [http://www.birohumas.baliprov.go.id/index.php/arti\\_kel-detail/53/RECLAMATION-TELUK-BENOA-UNTUK-MASA-DEPAN-BALI/](http://www.birohumas.baliprov.go.id/index.php/arti_kel-detail/53/RECLAMATION-TELUK-BENOA-UNTUK-MASA-DEPAN-BALI/)
- [4] Bourdieu, P. (2009). *An Introduction to the Work of Pierre Bourdieu: The Practice Theory* (translated by Pipit Maizier). Yogyakarta: Jalasutra
- [5] Direktorat Jenderal Kelautan, Pesisir dan Pulau-pulau Kecil. (2005). *Pedoman reclamation di wilayah pesisir*. Jakarta: Direktorat Jenderal Kelautan, Pesisir dan Pulau-Pulau Kecil.
- [6] Fajar, J. (2014, July 3). *Inilah Penjelasan Istana Tentang Perpres Reklamasi Teluk Benoa*. Retrieve from: <http://www.mongabay.co.id/2014/07/03/inila-h-penjelasan-istana-tentang-perpres-reclamation-teluk-benoa/>
- [7] Hutahaean, H. S. M. (2015). *Perlindungan Hukum Kawasan Konservasi Perairan Teluk Benoa Terhadap Rencana Reklamasi PT. Tirta Wahana Bali International (Doctoral dissertation, UAJY)*. Retrieve from :<http://e-journal.uajy.ac.id/7341/1/JURNAL.pdf>
- [8] Haryatmoko. (2016). *Critical Discourse Analysis (Analisis Wacana Kritis): Landasan Teori, Metodologi dan Penerapan*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- [9] Jazeri, M. (2013). *Pertarungan simbolik dalam wacana*



bantuan khusus mahasiswa. *LITERA*, 8(1).

- [10] Karmila, T.(2015, December 27). *Reklamasi Teluk Benoa Dalam Aspek Hukum*. Retrieve from: <http://documents.tips/documents/kajian-reclamation-teluk-benoa-dalam-aspek-hukumdoc.html>
- [11] Ketut Sudiarta dkk.(2013).*Laporan Kajian Modeling Dampak Perubahan Fungsi Teluk Benoa untuk Sistem Pendukung Keputusan (Decision Support System) dalam Jejaring KKP Bali*, Conservation International Indonesia.
- [12] Kusuma, T.(2012, November 30). *Konsep Tri Hita Karana dalam Mewujudkan Ajeg Bali*. Retrieve from:<http://tavongkusuma.blogspot.co.id/2012/11/konsep-tri-hita-karana-dalam-mewujudkan.html>
- [13] Mastuty, I. T., Noak, P. A., & Supriyanti, N. W. (2015). *Implementasi Kebijakan Pemerintah Provinsi Bali Dalam Moratorium Pembangunan Infrastruktur Akomodasi Pariwisata Hotel Di Kabupaten Badung*. CITIZEN CHARTER, 1(2).
- [14] Yuwono, N., dan Kodoatie, R.J.(2004). *Pedoman Pengembangan Reklamasi Pantai dan Perencanaan Bangunan Pengamanannya*. Direktorat Bina Teknik, Direktorat Jenderal Sumber Daya Air Departemen Permukiman Dan Prasarana Wilayah (Departemen Pekerjaan Umum), Jakarta.
- [15] Rusdiarti, S. R. (2003). *Bahasa, Pertarungan Simbolik dan Kekuasaan. dalam Basis*, (11-12), pp. 31-40.
- [16] Umum, D. P. (2007). *Peraturan Menteri Pekerjaan Umum Nomor: 05. PRT/M/2007 tentang Pedoman Setifikat Laik Fungsi Bangunan*. Jakarta (ID). Direktorat Jendral Cipta Karya.
- [17] Umum, D. P. (2008). *Pedoman Perencanaan Tata Ruang Kawasan Reklamasi Pantai*. Retrieve from: [http://birohukum.pu.go.id/pustaka/arsip\\_makalah/2.pdf](http://birohukum.pu.go.id/pustaka/arsip_makalah/2.pdf)
- [18] Oktavia, A.R. et.al.(2015, October 8).*Analisis Peraturan Presiden Nomor 51 tahun 2014 mengenai Reklamasi Teluk Benoa*. Makalah tugas kuliah di Prodi Ilmu Politik, Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta. Retrieve from <http://dokumen.tips/documents/makalah-reclamation-teluk-benoa.html>
- [19] Pastika, M.M.(2013, August 5).*Reklamasi Teluk Benoa untuk masa depan Bali*. Retrieve from <http://metroballi.com/2013/08/05/reclamation-teluk-benoa-untuk-masa-depan-bali/>
- [20] Poeijana, I.(2013, December 5).*Memandang Positif Reklamasi Teluk Benoa di Bali*. Retrieve from : [http://www.kompasiana.com/ikrar\\_poerjana31/mandang-positif-reclamation-teluk-benoa-di-bali\\_55284d836ea83497498b4581](http://www.kompasiana.com/ikrar_poerjana31/mandang-positif-reclamation-teluk-benoa-di-bali_55284d836ea83497498b4581)
- [21] Rusdiarti, S.R.(2003). *Bahasa, Pertarungan Simbolik, dan Kekuasaan*. Basis. No. 11-12, Tahun ke-52. November-Desember 2003.
- [22] Setiadi, E. M., & Kolip, U. (2011). *Pengantar sosiologi:pemahaman fakta dan gejala permasalahan sosial:teori, aplikasi dan pemecahannya*. Jakarta:Kencana.
- [23] Sobur, A.(2009). *Analisis teks media: Suatu pengantar untuk analisis wacana, analisi semiotika, dan analisis framing*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya

## Author Profile



**Arya Pageh Wibawa** received the ST. (Bachelor of Engineering) degree in electrical engineering from Sepuluh Nopember Institute of Technology Surabaya (ITS) in 2000 and M.Ds (Master of Design) from Bandung Institute of Technology (ITB) in 2012. He has been a lecturer in Departement of Visual Communication Design at Indonesian Institute of The Arts Denpasar since 2005. He has taught digital media and web design. Before becoming a lecturer, he has worked on many web projects especially e-commerce and travel agents by using PHP programming and MySQL for over 7 years. Now, he is still interested in blogging and developing e-commerce.