International Journal of Science and Research (IJSR)
ISSN: 2319-7064
Impact Factor 2024: 7.101

Comparing the Efficacy of Antidepressant Medications vs Psychotherapy for Managing Depression in Major Depressive Disorder

Tanush Anand

Delhi Public School International, HS-01, Golf Course Ext Rd, Block W, South City II, Sector 50, Gurugram, Haryana 122001, India
Corresponding Author Email: *tanushanand225[at]gmail.com*

Abstract: ***Major Depressive Disorder (MDD) is an impairing mental illness that significantly affects people's emotional, thinking, and physical abilities. Proper treatment is what is needed. The most frequent treatments are antidepressant drugs and psychotherapy, especially cognitive-behavioral therapy (CBT). This review contrasts the effectiveness of antidepressants and psychotherapy in the treatment of MDD. Research has established that both treatments are effective in reducing symptoms of depression, particularly in severe and moderate cases. Antidepressants, especially selective serotonin reuptake inhibitors (SSRIs), are usually quicker to make relief evident and thus are used for those who need to be treated immediately. Psychotherapy is usually associated with longer-term benefits and lower rates of relapse, especially where it is aimed at addressing the underlying thought and behavioral patterns. Most patients, especially those with resistant depression or chronic depression, respond more to combination therapy. Other things to consider include patient preference, symptom severity, availability of treatment, and comorbidities. The review also speaks about the biological and psychological determinants of treatment outcomes and underscores the necessity for treatment individualization. Though both therapies are beneficial, effectiveness could differ with patient case and treatment settings. Subsequent studies would aim to characterize biomarkers and predictive clinical variables for treatment response for enhancing clinical decision-making.***

Keywords: Depression, Psychotherapy, Anti-depressants, Major depressive disorder

1. Introduction

Major Depressive Disorder (MDD) is characterized by persistently depressed mood or anhedonia and loss of interest in activities that were once enjoyable, combined with other symptoms such as disturbance of sleep, fatigue, weight change or change in appetite, difficulty concentrating, feelings of worthlessness or guilt, and suicidal thoughts or thoughts about death repeatedly. Diagnosis is warranted by at least five of these symptoms for a period of at least two weeks, with at least depressed mood or anhedonia, and with significant impairment in social, occupational, or other critical areas of functioning [1]. Epidemiological studies report that MDD is extensively common globally and estimates of point prevalence in the range 4-5% and much higher estimates of lifetime prevalence with great heterogeneity by region, gender, and socioeconomic status [2]. The international prevalence is also impressive, and MDD contributes heavily to disability, morbidity, and mortality [2].

There are various subtypes or specifiers of MDD such as melancholic features, psychotic depression, seasonal pattern, rapid cycling, atypical depression, dysthymic (persistent depressive) course if the symptoms are chronic and of lower severity, and severity of graded mild, moderate, or severe. The differences affect the prognosis, selection of treatment, and response. Current treatment of MDD typically involves pharmacotherapy and psychotherapy, which may be combined, and in more complicated or treatment-refractory patients, electroconvulsive therapy (ECT) or other somatic therapy [3]. First-line drugs among the pharmacotherapies are selective serotonin reuptake inhibitors (SSRIs), serotonin-norepinephrine reuptake inhibitors (SNRIs), and other newer or second-generation antidepressants. Pricer classes such as tricyclic antidepressants (TCAs) and monoamine oxidase inhibitors (MAOIs) are used but typically reserved for use when first-line therapies are ineffective or not tolerated [4]. Evidence-based psychotherapy modalities are cognitive behavioral therapy (CBT), interpersonal psychotherapy (IPT), problem-solving therapy, and short-term psychodynamic therapy; their selection may vary on the basis of patient factors, severity, comorbidity, preference, availability of trained therapists, and cost [5]. Clinical guidelines practice recommends that with mild or moderate depression, psychotherapy alone or antidepressants alone may suffice, but with moderate to severe or chronic depression, the combination of pharmacotherapy and psychotherapy is generally preferred [6].

Even though both antidepressant drugs and psychotherapy are well-proven approaches with lots of evidence for their efficacy in good support, their comparative benefits under different circumstances (treatment in an acute context, long-term remission, prevention of relapse, side effect burdens) remain to be determined. This review article aims to comparatively analyze the efficacy of antidepressant medication vs. psychotherapy in treating depression in Major Depressive Disorder, integrating evidence from randomized controlled trials, meta-analyses, and guideline statements, to ascertain which modality or which combination of modalities is optimal for various clinical situations.

2. Major depressive disorder and depression

Major Depressive Disorder (MDD), also known as clinical depression, is a mood disorder that involves a prolonged and persistent feeling of sadness or a loss of interest in activities, which interferes with daily life.

Unlike temporary sadness, defined as a negative human emotion and characterized by feelings of unhappiness, loss, or disappointment, MDD is a mental health condition, which also means it has been defined by disorder classification systems. According to the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition (DSM-5), depression is characterized by: i. a depressed mood, ii. a loss of interest or pleasure in almost all activities, iii. significant (more than 5 percent in a month) unintentional weight loss/gain or decrease/increase in appetite, iv. sleep disturbance (insomnia or hypersomnia), v. psychomotor changes (agitation or retardation) severe enough to be observable by others, vi. tiredness, fatigue, or low energy, or decreased efficiency with which routine tasks are completed, vii. a sense of worthlessness or excessive, inappropriate, or delusional guilt, viii. impaired ability to think, concentrate, or make decisions and ix. recurrent thoughts of death (not just fear of dying), suicidal ideation, or suicide attempts [17]. These symptoms must be present for at least two weeks for a diagnosis. Different patients experience varying levels of severity. Furthermore, depression also has distinct subtypes, including melancholic, marked by a total loss of pleasure, a distinct quality of mood that doesn't respond to positive events, psychomotor changes, sleep disturbances, and weight loss, often with a worsening of symptoms in the morning; atypical, in which the symptoms stray from the traditional criteria and patients experience temporary mood boost from positive events, increased appetite, hypersomnia and rejection sensitivity; anxious depression, where patients have a more chronic course of illness, an increased incidence of suicidal thoughts and behavior, greater functional and occupational impairment, and poorer response to treatment; among others.

3. Anti-depressant medications

One of the most widely used treatments for MDD are antidepressants. Antidepressants are medications designed to help correct chemical imbalances in the brain that contribute to depression. In people with MDD, the brain's normal communication between neurons can be disrupted, often due to irregular levels of neurotransmitters such as serotonin, norepinephrine, and dopamine. Antidepressants work by restoring the balance of these chemicals, which can improve mood, sleep, appetite, and concentration over time. Common antidepressants include Selective Serotonin Reuptake Inhibitors (SSRIs), which increase levels of serotonin in the brain by preventing the reuptake of serotonin by nerves; Serotonin and Norepinephrine Reuptake Inhibitors (SNRIs), which work by blocking the reuptake of the neurotransmitters serotonin and norepinephrine in the brain, increasing their availability to nerve cells and improving mood; Tricyclic Antidepressants (TCAs), a class of older, effective medications for treating depression by increasing serotonin and norepinephrine in the brain; monoamine oxidase inhibitors (MAOIs), which work by blocking monoamine oxidase (MAO) enzymes, which break down neurotransmitters like serotonin, norepinephrine, and dopamine; Atypical antidepressants, which influence dopamine, norepinephrine and serotonin in a variety of ways, different from typical antidepressants. When a patient is administered an antidepressant, changes in neurotransmitter levels occur within hours or some days, as the drug binds to transporters and inhibits reuptake; however, most guidelines and clinical reviews suggest that some improvement may be noticed after 1 to 2 weeks, and the full therapeutic effect often takes 4 to 8 weeks or more. Despite there being a significant onset time, antidepressants have been proven for their efficacy in umbrella systematic reviews such as Köhler-Forsberg et al. [16], which supports that antidepressants have statistically and clinically significant efficacy over placebo in MDD / depressive disorders.

4. Psychotherapy

Although both antidepressants and psychotherapy have shown themselves to be, albeit very minorly, positive treatments to depression, most General Practitioners lean towards prescribing antidepressants to their patients suffering from depression. On the other hand, a majority of patients prefer to undergo therapy [15]. Psychotherapy is a method of treatment that uses interaction and dialogue to help patients identify and change problematic emotions, thoughts, and behaviors, with the goal of improving mental well-being and allowing individuals to cope with life challenges. In primary care specifically, which is where a majority of depressed patients would turn towards in hopes of being treated, the types of psychotherapy that have been best examined include cognitive behavior therapy (CBT), psychodynamic therapy and interpersonal psychotherapy (IPT). CBT aims to identify and change negative thought patterns that influence emotions and behaviour, helping individuals develop more balanced thinking and effective coping skills. Psychodynamic therapy explores how unconscious processes and past experiences influence a person's present feelings, behaviors, and relationships. Finally, IPT addresses problems in relationships and social functioning, helping individuals improve communication, manage conflicts, and adapt to life changes. While several other types of therapies exist, they have only extensively been researched in advanced mental health care. Research shows that around 75% of people show some benefit from psychotherapy, experiencing symptom relief and allowing them to function better in their daily lives. Depending on the type of challenges being dealt with, be it immediate or long term, the duration of psychotherapy can go from a few weeks or months to a couple of years as well.

5. Comparative Analysis of Medications vs Psychotherapy

Major Depressive Disorder (MDD) is one of the most prevalent and disabling of the psychiatric disorders worldwide. It is often treated with pharmacotherapy, psychotherapy, or both. Over the past several decades, numerous randomized controlled trials and meta-analyses have sought to determine the relative effectiveness of antidepressant treatment and psychotherapeutic approaches for maintaining control over acute symptoms and relapse prevention in the long term. Antidepressant medication, particularly selective serotonin reuptake inhibitors (SSRIs), is widespread and frequently first-line treatment of mild to severe depression. They decrease the function of neurotransmitters within the brain, primarily

serotonin, and cause relatively rapid relief from symptoms, generally in 4 to 6 weeks. However, psychotherapy, particularly Cognitive Behavioral Therapy (CBT), has also proven to possess robust efficacy in alleviating depressive symptoms. Both psychotherapy and pharmacotherapy were found to be equally effective for acute MDD treatment in a meta-analysis conducted by Cuijpers et al., with no significant difference in the overall effect size [7]. Treatment with a combination of both psychotherapy and antidepressants tends to yield the best outcomes, particularly with moderate to severe or chronic depression. Large-scale meta-analysis by Cuijpers et al. demonstrated that combined treatment showed higher rates of remission and response than either treatment used separately, particularly in the acute and continuation stages [8]. Another review also found that remission rates in patients receiving combination therapy were around 46% compared to 34% for those treated with psychotherapy alone [9]. This would suggest a synergistic relationship, where pharmacotherapy will reverse neurochemical dysbalances and psychotherapy can operate to prevent maladaptive behavior and thinking. Contextual aspects play a major part in the relative success of the two modalities. For example, a network meta-analysis in primary care settings showed that pharmacotherapy and psychotherapy were much better than treatment as usual, and neither was significantly different from the other on the response rate [10]. In more specialized psychiatric services and in treatment-resistant severe depression, medication could be initiated first due to its immediacy.

Individuals with less severe depression or treatment preferences likely stood to benefit more from psychotherapy since it has fewer dropouts and does not have medication side effects. Psychotherapy has shown to be beneficial for long-term outcomes and relapse prevention. Cognitive Behavioral Therapy, in particular, has been associated with reduced relapse rates after successful treatment, even in the absence of ongoing therapy. Studies have demonstrated that cognitive-behavioral therapy (CBT) equips individuals with enduring coping mechanisms, thereby enhancing psychological resilience against recurrent episodes of depression [11].

Moreover, Mindfulness-Based Cognitive Therapy (MBCT) and interpersonal Therapy (IPT) have demonstrated efficacy in maintenance and prevention of recurrence, especially in patients with recurrent depression.

Although antidepressant medication can prevent relapse if prescribed for months or years, it is also associated with weight gain, sexual dysfunction, and emotional blunting side effects that lead to discontinuation. Psychotherapy has a superior side effect profile and higher acceptability, especially among patients who are not keen on using medications. Comparative research has consistently reported lower dropout rates from psychotherapy compared to pharmacotherapy, showing higher patient satisfaction and adherence [12].

Interestingly, treatment selection should not be based solely on efficacy comparison. Patient preference, treatment availability, comorbid conditions, cost, and previous history of treatment are factors of importance in the clinical decision-making process. Individualized treatment approaches that balance biological, psychological, and social variables are increasingly being placed under the spotlight in contemporary clinical practice.

New research using predictive modeling and machine learning are attempting to identify which patients will gain the most benefit from treatments provided, towards an optimized model of care [8][13]. In conclusion, both antidepressants and psychotherapy are effective in treating Major Depressive Disorder, each having varying strengths depending on the clinical context. While pharmacotherapy is rapid in its impact, psychotherapy provides strong protection against relapse. Combination therapy typically results in the greatest benefit, especially in more complex or chronic cases. Finally, an individualized, patient-centered approach remains the gold standard in the care of depression.

6. Conclusions

While both antidepressants and psychotherapy have proven to be effective treatments for depression, antidepressants strictly look to address chemical imbalances in our nervous systems whereas psychotherapy looks to target more psychological and behavioural causes. The type of treatment used is heavily dependent on the severity and type of disorder, thus proving that neither treatment is universally superior compared to the other. Rather, a combined treatment has shown to produce the most effective and long-lasting results. Through psychotherapy, patients and practitioners are able to develop long lasting coping strategies, whereas medications offer faster but often temporary relief. In conclusion, the treatment a patient receives should be tailored to their specific needs and preferences, and that there is no one-size-fits all treatment to dynamic and complicated disorders such as MDD. The only best treatment is one that finds a balance between biological, psychological, and behavioural approaches, addressing both somatic symptoms as well as any underlying causes to achieve long term recovery and an overall improved quality of life.

7. Future Scope

Improving accuracy of treatment selection in MDD, specifically which patients will respond better to psychotherapy, medication, or both, needs to be addressed by future studies. Machine learning and predictive modeling have begun to show promise: a Veteran study reported baseline self-report and administrative variables to predict psychotherapy response at moderate levels [13]. In addition, long-term effects are not well studied; there must be more trials with follow-ups longer than 12 months to assess sustainability of response and relapse prevention by modality [14]. Finally, better knowledge about moderators and mediators of the treatment effect (e.g. chronicity, severity, comorbidities, patient preference) is needed, since earlier meta-analyses indicate that such factors have a considerable influence on the relative efficacy of psychotherapy, antidepressant medication, and their combination. [12].

Author's contributions: Tanush Anand conceptualised the study, did literature survey, wrote and corrected the manuscript.

Acknowledgement: I would like to thank my parents and teachers for their constant motivation and support.

Conflict of interest: There is no conflict of interest.

References

[1] S. Pierce, *Major depressive disorder*. New York: Lucent Press, 2018.
[2] A. J. Ferrari *et al.*, "Global variation in the prevalence and incidence of major depressive disorder: a systematic review of the epidemiological literature," *Psychological Medicine*, vol. 43, no. 3, pp. 471–481, Jul. 2013, doi: https://doi.org/10.1017/s0033291712001511.
[3] T. Bschor and M. Adli, "Treatment of Depressive Disorders," *Deutsches Aerzteblatt Online*, Nov. 2008, doi: https://doi.org/10.3238/arztebl.2008.0782.
[4] H. Kovich, W. Kim, and A. M. Quaste, "Pharmacologic treatment of depression," *American Family Physician*, vol. 107, no. 2, pp. 173–181, 2023, Available: https://www.aafp.org/pubs/afp/issues/2023/0200/pharmacologic-treatment-of-depression.html
[5] E. K. Hermann, S. Munsch, E. Biedert, and W. Lang, "Psychotherapy for depression," *Therapeutische Umschau. Revue therapeutique*, vol. 67, no. 11, pp. 581– 4, Nov. 2010, doi: https://doi.org/10.1024/0040-5930/a000099.
[6] E. Isometsä *et al.*, "Update on Current Care Guideline: Depression," *Duodecim; laaketieteellinen aikakauskirja*, vol. 131, no. 3, pp. 280–1, 2015, Available: https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/26245079/
[7] P. Cuijpers, M. Sijbrandij, S. L. Koole, G. Andersson, A. T. Beekman, and C. F. Reynolds, "The efficacy of psychotherapy and pharmacotherapy in treating depressive and anxiety disorders: a meta-analysis of direct comparisons," *World Psychiatry*, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 137–148, Jun. 2013, doi: https://doi.org/10.1002/wps.20038.
[8] E. Karyotaki *et al.*, "Combining pharmacotherapy and psychotherapy or monotherapy for major depression? A meta-analysis on the long-term effects," *Journal of Affective Disorders*, vol. 194, pp. 144–152, Apr. 2016, doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2016.01.036.
[9] P. Cuijpers, A. van Straten, L. Warmerdam, and G. Andersson, "Psychotherapy versus the combination of psychotherapy and pharmacotherapy in the treatment of depression: a meta-analysis," *Depression and Anxiety*, vol. 26, no. 3, pp. 279–288, Mar. 2009, doi: https://doi.org/10.1002/da.20519.
[10] P. Cuijpers *et al.*, "Psychologic Treatment of Depression Compared With Pharmacotherapy and Combined Treatment in Primary Care: A Network Meta-Analysis," *The Annals of Family Medicine*, vol. 19, no. 3, pp. 262–270, May 2021, doi: https://doi.org/10.1370/afm.2676.
[11] P. Cuijpers *et al.*, "Psychotherapies for depression: a network meta‐analysis covering efficacy, acceptability and long‐term outcomes of all main treatment types," *World Psychiatry*, vol. 20, no. 2, pp. 283– 293, May 2021, doi: https://doi.org/10.1002/wps.20860.
[12] P. Cuijpers, H. Noma, E. Karyotaki, C. H. Vinkers, A. Cipriani, and T. A. Furukawa, "A network meta‐analysis of the effects of psychotherapies, pharmacotherapies and their combination in the treatment of adult depression," *World Psychiatry*, vol. 19, no. 1, pp. 92–107, Jan. 2020, doi: https://doi.org/10.1002/wps.20701.
[13] H. N. Ziobrowski *et al.*, "Development of a model to predict psychotherapy response for depression among Veterans," *Psychological Medicine*, vol. 53, no. 8, pp. 3591–3600, Jun. 2023, doi: https://doi.org/10.1017/S0033291722000228.
[14] H. Chen *et al.*, "Effectiveness of CBT and its modifications for prevention of relapse/recurrence in depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials," *Journal of Affective Disorders*, vol. 319, no. 1, pp. 469–481, Dec. 2022, doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2022.09.027.
[15] P. Cuijpers, S. Quero, C. Dowrick, and B. Arroll, "Psychological Treatment of Depression in Primary Care: Recent Developments," *Current Psychiatry Reports*, vol. 21, no. 12, Nov. 2019, doi: https://doi.org/10.1007/s11920-019-1117-x.
[16] Ole Köhler‐Forsberg *et al.*, "Efficacy and Safety of Antidepressants in Patients With Comorbid Depression and Medical Diseases," *JAMA Psychiatry*, Sep. 2023, doi: https://doi.org/10.1001/jamapsychiatry.2023.2983.
[17] Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration, "DSM-IV to DSM-5 Major Depressive Episode/Disorder Comparison," *Nih.gov*, Jun. 2020. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK519712/table/ch3.t5/

Author Profile

I am a 12th grade (DP 2) student currently studying at DPS International Gurgaon. Since the 8th grade (MYP 3), I've been fascinated by the subject of biology, especially its neuroscience field. Furthermore, upon joining the Diploma Programme I had taken up Psychology at the standard level and got to learn further about mental disorders such as MDD, which led me to explore the various treatments of depression and finally write this review article.